

Application Number: DM/2018/00707

Proposal: Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 4).

Address: Residential Quarters Redchillies Thai And Indian Restaurant Five Lanes North Fives Lanes Caerwent

Applicant: Mr C PRYCE

Plans: Elevations - Proposed 03 - , Site Layout S.01 - , Floor Plans - Proposed WD.1.02 - , Floor Plans - Proposed WD.1.01 - , Location Plan SL.01 - ,

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

Case Officer: Ms Kate Young
Date Valid: 01.05.2018

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

1.1 This planning application was deferred at the meeting of Committee held on 7th August 2018 to be refused, contrary to the recommendation of officers. The application is therefore re-presented to Committee with a recommendation for refusal.

1.2 Members concerns related to the scale and position of the garage element of the proposal. The reason for refusal offered to reflect those concerns is set out below:

1.3 Reason for refusal:

1. The scale and mass of the garage as built is excessive, its layout pushed forward of the common building line of this development is out of character in relation to the remainder of the development and it has an unacceptable overbearing effect on the amenity of the neighbouring dwelling to the east, conflicting with Policies S17, DES1 b), c), and d) and EP1 of the adopted Monmouthshire Local Development Plan.

PREVIOUS REPORT (7th August Committee meeting)

1.1 In September 2017 a reserved matters application was approved for the development of four detached dwellings on this site. These dwellings are currently under construction; however they have not been built in accordance with the approved plans. This application seeks alterations to plot 4 which is the easternmost property adjacent to Wern House. The alterations to plot 4 are that the garage has been moved closer to the house and attached to it. In addition the eaves height of the garage has been increased. A window and door have been removed from the side elevation and there are also some minor alterations to the fenestration.

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY (if any)

Reference Number	Description	Decision	Decision Date
-------------------------	--------------------	-----------------	----------------------

DM/2018/00704	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 1).	Approved	26.06.2018
DM/2018/00707	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 4).	Pending Determination	
DM/2018/00708	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 2).	Approved	26.06.2018
DC/2017/00324	Development of 4 detached dwellings on existing vacant site		
DM/2018/00684	Discharge of condition 3 (final archaeology report). Relating to DC/2017/00728.	Approved	31.05.2018
DM/2018/00704	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 1).	Approved	26.06.2018
DM/2018/00707	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 4).	Pending Determination	
DM/2018/00708	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 2).	Approved	26.06.2018
DM/2018/00709	Application to retain amendments to approved application DC/2017/00728. (Site 3).	Approved	26.06.2018
DC/2015/00838	Discharge of conditions 5 and 9 from appeal planning consent APP/E6840/A/14/2227457.	Approved	25.09.2015
DC/1973/00032	Residential APP_TYP 02 = Outline DEV_TYP 01 = New Development MAP_REF = 344840190760	Refused	18.12.1974
DC/2013/00259	Proposed conversion of redundant former restaurant with staff living accommodation into 5 houses with detached car ports	Approved	15.08.2013

DC/2012/00659	Proposed conversion of redundant former restaurant with staff living accommodation into 7 no. terraced houses with detached car ports	Refused	13.12.2012
DC/1983/01084	Alterations APP_TYP 01 = Full DEV_TYP 03 = Extension MAP_REF = 344881190781	Approved	13.12.1983
DC/2017/01309	Discharge of conditions 2 and 3 relating to application DC/2017/00728.	Approved	11.12.2017
DC/1976/01125	Erectn Lounge/Cocktail Bar Etc APP_TYP 01 = Full DEV_TYP 03 = Extension MAP_REF = 344900190780	Approved	09.03.1977
DC/2017/00728	Development of 4 detached dwellings on existing vacant site. Seeking to get consent for general site layout and approval of 4 house designs. Any other matters to seek approval as listed.	Approved	08.09.2017
DC/2003/01354	New Entrance Porch, Timber Decking And Pagoda Structure	Approved	08.01.2004
DC/1989/01588	Internal Alterations And Refurbishment. External Refurbishment.	Refused	01.08.1990
DC/1989/01591	Name Signs, Swing Signs And Amenity Boards.	Refused	01.08.1990

3.0 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

Strategic Policies

S1 LDP The Spatial Distribution of New Housing Provision
S4 LDP Affordable Housing Provision
S13 LDP Landscape, Green Infrastructure and the Natural Environment
S17 LDP Place Making and Design

Development Management Policies

H6 LDP Extension of Rural Dwellings
DES1 LDP General Design Considerations
EP1 LDP Amenity and Environmental Protection

4.0 REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 Consultation Replies

Carewnt Community Council - this Council recommends refusal.

The amendments to the above four planning applications make significant changes to originally approved plans.

Plot 1: Cesspit put in - planning application approved on cesspit. Cesspit has developed leaks. Major aquifer running through the area and they are trying to protect them. Builder looking at installing small package treatment plant. 5 cubic metre capacity cesspit is very small capacity - looking at other avenues. Plot 1 significant changes into residential accommodation and so there is no current garage on that plot, query as to future application to erect a garage. Garage was separate originally and linked to main residence by covered walkway, now changed to living accommodation for family reasons increasing residence footprint by more than 50%. All the other plots have garages (of sorts).

Plot 4: Garage originally well forward. Positions of houses appears to not match original location as on original plans much closer to existing property Wern House - impinging on light and view. Size of garage heights differ from original plans. Significant change to original plans including movement of garage.

Plot 1 and 4 - Significant changes to the original plans. Risen in height and created first floor level room with a window. One plot described as a garage on the plans but only has a window to access.

4.2 Neighbour Notification

One letter of objection was received.

I object to the dwelling that has been built next to me, there are rooms being provided above the garage. They will be built in my line of sight.

5.0 EVALUATION

5.1 Principle of the proposed development

5.1.1 The dwelling already has the benefit of planning permission and therefore the principle of a new residential dwelling in this location is already established. The main considerations in this case are the impact of the proposal on the residential amenity of the adjoining occupiers and the visual impact on the street scene.

5.2 Residential Amenity

5.2.1 Wern House is located immediately to east of this site. There is a mature hedge along the common boundary. The alterations which are the subject of this application would move the garage further back in the plot. It would be a minimum of 2 metres from the common boundary. Although the eaves height has been raised the roof will slope away from the boundary. Wern House has several windows on the side elevation facing towards the site. There is also a driveway between the two properties. There are no windows on the side elevation of the garage facing towards Wern House. There is no unacceptable level of overlooking because of the hedge along the boundary and the fact that the new dwelling on plot 4 has no windows facing towards Wern House. Given that the garage has been moved further back in the plot, it could be seen that the amended scheme is an improvement in terms of residential amenity. The increase in the eaves height is not so significant to adversely affect the residential amenity to the occupiers of Wern House. When viewed from Wern House only the roof of the garage is visible and the pitch slopes away from the boundary. The alterations do not have a significant adverse impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties and therefore accords with the objectives of policies DES1 and EP1 of the LDP.

5.3 Visual Impact.

5.3.1 The fact that the garage is now attached to the main house means that it has less visual impact. It is also set back further in the plot making it less visually prominent when viewed from the A48 and the road from Llanfair Discoed. The increase in the eaves height is not perceivable when viewed from outside the site. The amended scheme does still maintain reasonable levels of privacy and amenity to the occupiers of the neighbouring property. It is constructed to a high quality design and the finishing materials are acceptable. The current application accords with the objectives of Policy DES1 of the LDP.

5.4 Affordable Housing

5.4.1 Although this is a full application for a new dwelling there is no requirement for a financial contribution for affordable housing in accordance with policy S4 because essentially this is an amendment to an approved scheme. The dwellings which were the subject of the reserved matters application did not have to contribute because the outline was approved at appeal prior to the adoption of the SPG relating to affordable housing contributions.

5.5 Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

5.5.1 The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales has been considered, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the WBFG Act). In reaching this recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been taken into account and it is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in section 8 of the WBFG Act.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

1 The development shall be carried out in accordance with the list of approved plans set out in the table below.

REASON: To ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved drawings, for the avoidance of doubt.